

ADVISORY AND FINANCE COMMITTEE
MEETING MINUTES
of
February 19, 2014

A meeting of the Advisory & Finance Committee was held on Wednesday, February 19, 2014. The meeting was called to order by Chairman, John Moody at 7:00 p.m. and was conducted at the Plymouth Town Hall, in the Mayflower II Meeting Room, 11 Lincoln Street, Plymouth, Massachusetts.

PRESENT

Thirteen members of the Committee were present:

John Moody, Michael Hanlon, Linda Benezra, Michael Hourahan, Marc Sirrico, Harry Salerno, Charles Stevens, Cornelius Bakker, Ethan Kusmin, Shelagh Joyce Robert Morgan, Michael Duffley and Richard Gladdys

ABSENT

Two members of the Committee were absent:

Christopher Merrill, Nancy McSpadden

AGENDA ITEMS

ATM Article 7A-E Operating Budgets & Sub-Committee Reports

Report of Budget Sub-Committee E

Linda Benezra, Chair, Michael Hourahan, Charles Stevens

See attached Report of Budget Sub-Committee E for the following Departments/Divisions:

#175 Community Planning	#189 Redevelopment Authority	#241 Building/Zoning
#510 Board of Health	#541 Council on Aging	#543 Veterans Services
#549 Comm. on Disabilities	#610 Library	#695 1749 Court House

Chairman John Moody said that Sub-Committee E delivered their recommendations at the last meeting which were accepted and voted unanimously, however there was a protocol issue, so synopsis of recommendations will be heard again.

Linda Benezra then made the following budget recommendations on behalf of Sub-Committee E:

Council on Aging –

Initiatives & Opportunities: The sub-committee expressed concern for the proposed allocation of \$10,000 for maintenance of grounds, which will be bid and could be decreased. Grading on the site was suggested as a reason for such a high preliminary bid. However, we asked that consideration be given to working with the school maintenance to perhaps reduce this expense.

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager’s recommended budget of \$362,662.

Comments/Other: The Council on Aging has recently partnered with Plymouth North High School for the meals program.

Veterans Services –

Initiatives & Opportunities: The Veterans Affairs office has relocated from Town Hall to the new Senior Center.

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends a reduction of \$800 in the mileage line based on the two previous fiscal years of \$496 and \$565 as well as a current to date of \$377. We recommend approval of the Town Manager's recommended budget with this reduction to \$962,862.

Comments/Other: In the future a new State benefit of dental work and hearing aids could negatively impact this budget.

Disabilities Commission–

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends the approval of the Town Manager's recommended budget of \$200.

Comments/Other: An example of the Commissioners resourcefulness – they obtained funds from the Plymouth Growth & Development Fund from handicapped parking fines to pay for beach wheel chairs.

Library –

Initiatives & Opportunities: The Library continues to emphasize growth in electronic content services to meet the changing needs of the community. Historically, the library generates approximately \$30,000 - \$35,000 per year into the General Fund from fines of 10 cents per day for overdue or lost materials. A three-day grace period is allowed before fines begin.

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager's recommended budget of \$1,593,919.

Comments/Other: The Library had one Article 8 equipment request to replace a portion of the Library Garden Lattice Fence for \$5,600. The Town Manager denied the request. Additionally, there is an Article 9 Capital request to replace climate Control Unit in Bartlett Hall History Room for \$42,500. The Library receives additional support from the Library Corporation which fundraises on behalf of the Library. The Corporation also oversees 13 trust funds dedicated to the Library. Each year it provides approximately \$60,000 in additional funds.

1749 Court House –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager's recommended budget of \$13,744. Although we thought the lawn service estimate was high we were advised that it would include changing the grounds to a less maintenance needy design. We further recommend that more attention be paid to this unique piece of our history.

Comments/Other: The 1749 Courthouse is open seasonally from April through October with special openings and programs for Thanksgiving and Christmas. The Courthouse is open for 19 hours per week during the season. The museum houses the Town's first fire engine, the Town hearse, the Plymouth gallows, and the original stick of the "Rules of Thumb". This Court House that is on the National Historic Register hosts thousands of visitors each year. It is the oldest wooden Court House and the longest used municipal building in America.

Building/Zoning –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends an increase in "salary & wages temporary" of \$7,000 and in overtime of \$5,998 to the levels requested by the Department Head. As this department generates significant income it is important that it be as efficient as possible. Use of personnel from these two line items will provide the services needed without adding additional expenses to the benefit

categories. Additionally, these efficiencies would add value to expediting the permitting process another goal often discussed. We recommend a budget of \$574,262.

Comments/Other: Building & Zoning anticipates FY15 revenue to be approximately \$1,500,000 from fees and fines. Department revenue fluctuates with building activity and economic conditions, but is showing a significant increase in FY14 with \$959,385 to date and FY13 actual of \$1,207,126 (Calendar year 2013 as of \$1,469,063).

Board of Health –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends the approval of the Town Manager’s recommended budget of \$262,502.

Comments/Other: It is noted that the Board of Health generates an estimated \$458,000 in revenue annually from fees and fines, making the department a revenue center that brings in significantly more revenue than it spends.

Community Planning –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager’s recommended budget of \$675,243.

Comments/Other:

- The appropriation to the Economic Development Foundation is a long-standing budget item. The Foundation partners with other agencies to provide workshops on business and financial planning for small businesses, supports businesses expressing an interest in relocating to Plymouth, and assists the Town with infrastructure improvement efforts through Tax increment Financing (TIF) arrangements and other consultation. Due to the Chamber of Commerce withdrawing, this would be an ideal time to review our commitment to Economic Development and Tourism and how we would best be served.
- The Office of Community Development, headed by Bruce Arons, is funded entirely from federal and state funds including CDBG Housing Rehab Program (\$208,000), Title V Septic Loan Program, Microenterprise Small Business Loan Program (presently \$232,035 in loans outstanding), and Plymouth Municipal Affordable Housing Trust (current outstanding loans of \$639,445).

Redevelopment Authority –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager’s recommended budget of \$41,340.

Comments/Other: The Redevelopment Authority is a 5 member board with 4 elected and 1 appointed by the State.

Comments/Discussion Regarding Report of Budget Sub-Committee C:

Dinah O’Brien, Director of Community Services, stated the reduction of \$800 in the mileage causes a severe impact to providing outreach.

Richard Gladdys moved to restore \$800 to Veterans Services for mileage.

Cornelius Bakker, second. The motion carries (9-2-1) Linda Benezra and Michael Hourahan voting in opposition. Charles Stevens abstained.

Mr. Moody turned the meeting over to Mr. Hanlon so that he could present and discuss the Sub-Committee A and B reports.

Report of Budget Sub-Committee A – Administration/Misc. /Marine & Environmental Affairs

John Moody, Chair, Michael Duffley, Richard Gladdys, Nancy McSpadden, Harry Salerno

See attached Report of Budget Sub-Committee A for the following Departments/Divisions:

#123 Town Manager/BOS	#482 Airport Enterprise	#152 Human Resources
#910 Member Benefits	#161 Town Clerk	#945 All Town Insurance
#295 Harbor Master	#427 Environmental Mgmt	#292 Animal Control

John Moody presented the Sub-Committee A reports and recommendations:

Town Manager/BOS –

Initiatives & Opportunities: The sub-committee explored the opportunity of further reducing the Legal Services line item based on the fact that spending in FY13 and year-to-date FY14 are substantially below budget. The Town Manager observed that certain bargaining units refuse to meet with management for any discussions without its legal counsel present and that deferred discussions will require additional Town spending for Legal Services expenses going forward.

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager’s budget as submitted at \$889,977.

John Moody made a motion to recommend the Town Manager’s recommended budget amount of \$889,977. Robert Morgan, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Human Resources –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Human Resources budget as submitted at \$307,642.

John Moody made a motion to recommend the Town Manager’s recommended budget amount of \$307,642. Michael Duffley, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Town Clerk –

Initiatives & Opportunities: The sub-committee explored the possibility of using in-house IT staff to perform the ballot programming as a cost saving initiative. Mr. Pizer indicated that in discussions with Town Clerks from towns that have in-sourced that function there is resounding evidence that the savings are minimal and outsourcing the function is well worth the cost.

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommended a reduction of the Town Manager’s recommended budget, reducing temporary wages by \$2,741 and technology line by \$2,382. The basis for the recommendation is acknowledgement of the high variability of these costs, as observed by the Town Clerk, balanced against the actual spending below budget, generally over the most recent complete three Fiscal Years (FY11-FY13). Temporary Salaries & Wages have been over-budgeted on average by more than \$10,000 and Technical Services by an average of \$1,200. The sub-committee’s budget recommendation is based on allowing 5% more than the highest spending over those three Fiscal Years. The sub-committee recommends a FY15 budget for the Town Clerk’s office of \$492,402, a 1% reduction to the proposed budget.

John Moody made a motion to recommend the modified budget amount of \$492,402. Charles Stevens, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Animal Control –

Initiatives & Opportunities: The Director of Marine & Environmental Affairs observed during discussions that the Plymouth Animal Shelter could serve as a regional care center for abandoned, injured or otherwise disenfranchised animals. The sub-committee believes the idea may have merit and may represent a self-sustaining, if not revenue generating, community service. The sub-committee encourages pursuit of a preliminary assessment to evaluate the potential of the idea.

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommended a reduction of the Town Manager's recommended budget, reducing supplies and materials by \$1,500 (30%). The Revolving Fund may be used to make up the difference needed to provide appropriate care for animals. In addition, the sub-committee recommends the creation of a policy and/or standing formula for the use of the Animal Shelter Adoption Revolving Fund to supplement the annual budget for animal care and mirror repairs or improvements to the shelter. The methodology should account for the anticipated annual revenues and seek to maintain a long-term, sustainable balance that will provide an annual supplement to the budget while holding a reserve for unforeseeable operational circumstances. The sub-committee recommends a FY15 budget for Animal Control of \$120,327, a 1.2% reduction to the proposed budget.

John Moody made a motion to recommend the modified budget amount of \$120,327. Linda Benezra, second. The motion carries (11-1-0). Cornelius Bakker voting in opposition.

Harbor Master –

Initiatives & Opportunities: The On-Line Mooring System included in Article 8 requests will enable mooring owners to pay fees and manager their relationship with the Harbor Master and permit transient boaters to notify the Harbor Master of planned arrivals and make docking arrangements in advance. The Harbor Master indicates that such systems enhance the attractiveness of a port and attract new and returning boat-based visitors to the Town.

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Harbor Master budget as submitted at \$322,562.

John Moody made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$322,562. Linda Benezra, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Environmental Management –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Environmental Management budget as submitted at \$349,889.

John Moody made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$349,889. Cornelius Bakker, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Airport Enterprise –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Airport Enterprise budget as submitted at \$2,538,909.

John Moody made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$2,538,919. Richard Gladdys, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Member Benefits –

Initiatives & Opportunities: Management indicates it is exploring the opportunity of changing the financial arrangement for Managed Blue coverage from Premium to self-funded as enrollment continues to grow in that program.

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommended an overall reduction to the Member Benefits budget of \$28,034 (-0.6%). Our review of historical budgets and spending (FY10 through FY14) on all line items suggests a pattern of over-budgeting on some line items that appears to continue into the current budget proposal. Detailed recommended deductions are: Reducing Employer Medicare by \$20,874 (-1.5%). Reducing Wellness Program by \$5,000 (-33.3%). Reducing Disability Insurance by \$1,080 (-1.5%). Reducing Life Insurance by \$1,080 (-3%). The sub-committee recommends a FY15 budget for Member Benefits of \$4,960,591.

John Moody made a motion to recommend the modified budget amount of \$4,960,591. Linda Benezra, second.

Lynne Barrett Director of Finance stated that she is particularly concerned with the reductions in Member Benefits and provided a spreadsheet showing the current expenditures for FY14. Ms. Barrett said she will be submitting a supplemental budget request under STM Article 2 for \$267,000. Ms. Barrett indicated there are several revolving accounts at the School Department in which salaries are paid from and the town is responsible for paying the Medicare match. Lynne Barrett did agree with the 3% claims trust and expressed concerns with anticipating claims 12 to 18 months in the future and enrollments are based on numbers from last November and the number is fluid and moves monthly based on retirements and new hires.

Ethan Kusmin made a motion to amend by adding back the \$20,874 to Employee Medicare. Cornelius Bakker, second. The motion to amend carries (10-1-1). Richard Gladdys voting in opposition. Charles Stevens abstained.

Returning to the main motion as amended, recommending the amended modified budget amount of \$4,981,465. The motion carries (10-1-1) Richard Gladdys voting in opposition. Charles Stevens abstained.

All Town Insurance –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Insurance budget at \$820,810.

John Moody made a motion to recommend the Town Manager’s recommended budget amount of \$820,810. Robert Morgan, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Report of Budget Sub-Committee B - Department of Finance

Harry Salerno, Chair, Nancy McSpadden, Christopher Merrill, Marc Sirrico, John Moody

See attached Report of Budget Sub-Committee B for the following Departments/Divisions:

#114 Moderator	#158 Tax Title Foreclosures	#132 Reserve Fund
#710 Long Term Debt	#133 Finance & Accounting	#750 Long Term Interest
#138 Procurement Division	#752 Short Term Interest	#141 Assessing Division
#753 Misc. Interests	#146 Treasury/Collections	#755 Bond Issuance
#155 Information Tech	#911 Pension Contributions	#130 Fuel/Utility
#914 Member Insurance	#129 Salary Reserve	#913 Unemployment Trust
#915 OPEB Trust	#916 Compensated Absences	

Harry Salerno presented the Sub-Committee B reports and recommendations:

Moderator –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of a budget of \$2,100 for the Town Moderator. Funding for this elected position is voted by Town Meeting annually as Article 6.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$2,100. Linda Benezra, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Fin Comm Reserve Fund –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager's recommended budget of \$130,000.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$130,000. Michael Duffley, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Salary Reserve –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager's recommended budget of \$100,000.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$100,000. John Moody, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Finance & Accounting –

Initiatives & Opportunities: Implementation of several modules within the MUNIS system, including Benefits Enrollment and Employment Application and On-Boarding are anticipated to improve the efficiency of those processes by replacing paper-based process with electronic. A minor increase in Training costs support those initiatives. Work of the Internal Auditor in support of Annual town Audit presents an opportunity to negotiate a lower fee for the Annual Audit. A new multi-year contract for annual audit services is up for negotiation at this time.

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager's recommended budget of \$573,816. In addition, the sub-committee, while acknowledging the value of continuing the relationship with the existing external auditor in terms of understanding historical context of the Town's performance, recommends consideration of alternative auditors and incorporating the value of pre-work conducted by the Town's internal auditor into contract negotiations and determination of the annual cost for the audit.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$573,816. Linda Benezra, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Procurement –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager's recommended budget of \$445,503.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$445,503. John Moody, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Assessing –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager's recommended budget of \$482,740.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$482,740. John Moody, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Treasury/Collections –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager’s recommended budget of \$533,088.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager’s recommended budget amount of \$533,088. Marc Sirrico, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Information Technology –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager’s recommended budget of \$676,721.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager’s recommended budget amount of \$676,721. Linda Benezra, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Fuel/Utility Fund –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager’s recommended budget of \$1,973,904.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager’s recommended budget amount of \$1,973,904. Michael Duffley, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Tax Title Foreclosure –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager’s recommended budget of \$365,202.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager’s recommended budget amount of \$365,202. Michael Hourahan, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Debt & Interest Expenses –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager’s recommended amounts for each of the debt and interest budgets:

710 Long Term Debt	\$ 6,636,095
750 Long Term Interest	\$ 3,773,137
752 Short Term Interest	\$ 881,500
753 Misc Interest	\$ 5,000
755 Bond Issuance Costs	<u>\$ 50,000</u>
Total:	\$11,345,732

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager’s recommended budget amount of \$11,345,732. Linda Benezra , second. The motion carries unanimously.

Mr. Hanlon opened the Public Hearing at 8:30 p.m. on the FY2015 Operating & Capital Budgets in accordance with the Town Charter, Section 2-12-2.

Town Meeting Member, Pat McCarthy, asked if it is true that the proposed budget includes \$200,000 for tax title work on the Thousand Acre property. John Moody responded that that is not included in the budget. Pat McCarthy then asked that while presenting the solid waste budget, if they could please answer whether or not the operating budget is subsidizing the recycling program.

Harry Salerno continued with the Sub-Committee B presentation:

Pension Contribution –

Initiatives & Opportunities: The A&F Committee may wish to create a sub-committee to review the Pension and Other Post Employment Benefits funding and actuarial assumptions. This sub-committee could meet and develop a package of material for review and discussion by the full Committee outside of budget season to develop a broader understanding of the issues within the community. This is a major financial issue for the Town and deserves to have a detailed and thorough review with a goal of understanding the long term plan.

Recommendations: The sub-committee is recommending approval of the Town Manager's requested appropriation of \$9,797,679.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$9,797,679. Linda Benezra, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Member Insurance –

Recommendations: The Sub-Committee recommends:

- Reduce the Town contribution to the medical Healthcare Trust Fund by \$425,000. Reducing the Town contribution also reduces the employee contribution by approximately \$80,000, creating an overall reduction to Trust revenues for FY15 of approximately \$505,000. The Town Contribution to Member Insurance would be reduced to \$28,088,797.
- Collaboration between Town staff and the Advisory & Finance Committee to establish a policy (and formula) for Healthcare and Dental Trust funding to drive future calculations in a consistent manner.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the modified budget amount of \$28,088,797.

John Moody, second.

Shelagh Joyce asked about increases and/or decreases to health benefits. Ms. Barrett said there have been increases to the co-pays.

Ms. Barrett expressed concern with House Bill 59, which will change some eligibility requirements for retiree health insurance. House Bill 59 will increase the eligibility with some grandfathering and there is concern that there could be a huge increase in retirements. Ms. Barrett asked the committee to leave the budget at the town manager's recommended amount.

John Moody said he understands Ms. Barrett's concerns and added that he has spent 30+ years drilling into health claims data and the volume of service. Plymouth's claims over the past couple years are reducing and there is currently a reduction in health claims. Mr. Moody indicated the cushion remaining in the trust is more than adequate.

Ms. Barrett said if there are new employees, should House Bill 59 pass causing retirements, there would be a requirement for funding.

The motion carries unanimously.

OPEB Trust Funding –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends changing the proposed FY15 allocation to \$145,000 as the current allocation, while following the budget guideline of level-funding, suggest a calculated funding rationale.

Harry Salerno and made a motion to recommend the modified budget amount of \$145,000. Charles Stevens, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Unemployment Compensation –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager’s recommended budget of \$100,000.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager’s recommended budget amount of \$100,000. Linda Benezra , second. The motion carries unanimously.

Compensated Absences –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Town Manager’s recommended budget of \$100,000.

Harry Salerno made a motion to recommend the Town Manager’s recommended budget amount of \$100,000. John Moody, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Mr. Moody returned to chair the remainder of the meeting.

Report of Budget Sub-Committee C - Public Safety Services

Charles Stevens, Chair, Robert Morgan, Michael Hanlon, Richard Gladdys, Michael Hourahan

See attached Report of Budget Sub-Committee C for the following Departments/Divisions:

#210 Police Department

#291 Emergency Management

#220 Fire Department

#293 Parking Enforcement

Charles Stevens presented the Sub-Committee C reports and recommendations:

Parking Enforcement -

Recommendations: The subcommittee recommends the adoption of the Parking Enforcement budget as recommended by the Selectmen.

Charles Stevens made a motion to recommend the Town Manager’s recommended budget amount of \$31,204. Linda Benezra , second. The motion carries unanimously.

Emergency Management -

Recommendations: The subcommittee recommends the adoption of the Emergency Management budget as recommended by the Selectmen.

Charles Stevens made a motion to recommend the Town Manager’s recommended budget amount of \$19,900. Linda Benezra , second. The motion carries unanimously.

Fire Department-

Recommendations:

1. The committee is very disappointed that no visible progress has been made on the recommendation in last year’s Department budget report regarding the establishment of a central dispatch facility for the town public safety functions. In the case of the Fire Department, uniformed, trained firefighters are serving as dispatchers for the department. In addition, the Town is paying to equip and train these personnel for a function they cannot serve in due to their dispatch duties. As expressed in the Police budget report, this duality of coverage and the delay in timely dispatching of emergency crews does not serve the town well.
2. While not mentioned in last year’s report, the continued delay in reviewing the sighting and possible consolidation of fire stations may be unnecessarily costing the Town money.
3. The subcommittee recommends the adoption of the Fire Department budget as proposed by the Selectmen.

Charles Stevens made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$9,133,622. Linda Benezra, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Police Department -

Initiatives & Opportunities: The major cost savings to the Town in this department between the 2014 and 2015 budgets is the cost reduction in school crossing guard costs due to outsourcing. Consolidation recommendation.

Recommendations:

1. The sub-committee strongly recommends that the Selectmen, the Town Manager and the Police Chief review the need for additional police officers. The International Association of Police Chiefs recommended staffing levels for departments is 2.2 officers for each 1000 population members. Counting only winter residents, Plymouth is currently staffed at 1.7 per thousand. Thus, the department is 26 officers below its recommended winter staffing levels. According to Chief Botieri, it takes three officers to actually increase one officer on duty due to training lead times and shift requirements. It takes approximately 12 months from the time a candidate joins the force to actually put them on patrol. The sub-committee strongly feels that as we approach the expected police needs for the 2020 celebrations and the projected future growth of Plymouth, the need to bring the force to recommended staffing levels should be addressed now rather than postponed to future budgets. Even minimal increases in officer staffing might contribute to a reduction in overtime costs to the department.
2. As in our 2012 report, the sub-committee is very concerned with the lack of movement toward centralization of the dispatcher needs of the fire and police departments and ambulance service. The current disbursement of dispatchers across all three services negatively impacts safety. As an example, calls currently coming into 911 must be routed to the various services for processing. If, after arriving on scene, additional help is needed, the resulting call backs to dispatch and the resulting time lag in response by the units needed degrades the ability of all the services to effectively perform their missions
3. The subcommittee recommends adoption of the Police Department budget as recommended by the Board of Selectmen.

Charles Stevens made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$8,981,352. Michael Hanlon, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Report of Budget Sub-Committee D - Public Works

Michael Hanlon, Chair, Cornelius Bakker, Linda Benezra, Michael Duffley

See attached Report of Budget Sub-Committee D for the following Departments/Divisions:

#411 Engineering Division	#6601-433 Solid Waste Enterprise	#420 Highway Division
#0010-433 Solid Waste General	#440 Sewer Enterprise	#421 Administration
#450 Water Enterprise	#422 Building Maintenance	#491 Cemetery Division
#423 Snow & Ice Removal	#630 Recreation Division	#490 Crematory Division
#425 Fleet Maintenance	#492 Parks & Forestry Division	

Michael Hanlon presented the Sub-Committee D reports and recommendations:

DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC WORKS (not including enterprise funds and snow & ice budget) -

Initiatives & Opportunities:

Highway: The Highway Division has seven vacancies and is seeking to fill the positions. It is our understanding that the Division has had difficulty filling vacant positions in the past due to collective bargaining requirements that employees possess certain licenses and certifications that may not be necessary. We recommend that management review these requirements at the next opportunity.

DPW Administration: The DPW budget includes \$193,620 for "Project Details" for traffic control. Several years ago the Governor signed legislation that allowed the use of "flagmen" for traffic control on state highways in an effort to reduce costs and save money. This issue should be reviewed by town management with the goal of reducing the cost of traffic control details in Plymouth while ensuring the safety of both the travelling public and construction workers. The DPW has tried to reduce this cost by being more selective in the use of traffic control details.

Recreation: This division has three significant revolving accounts for recreation programs, Memorial Hall, and Hedges Pond. These revolving fund budgets for FY2015 more than double the Recreation Division's annual operating budget. This year the sub-committee asked for, and received, more detailed budgets for all DPW revolving fund accounts, which included starting and ending balances, and detailed revenue and expense projections. We recommend that the Advisory & Finance Committee adopt this methodology for all revolving funds from the perspective of enhancing transparency and accountability.

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends the approval of the DPW budget in the amount of \$5,737,212 for FY2015. Additionally the sub-committee has reviewed the proposed departmental equipment budget in Article 8 and the proposed capital facilities budget in Article 9, and concurs with the Town Manager's recommendations.

Michael Hanlon made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$5,737,212. Richard Gladdys, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Charles Stevens asked about the \$100,000 approved to monitor the maintenance of town properties. Mr. Beder said they are working with Procurement to get the program started.

Pat McCarthy again inquired about the PAYT program being self funding and not being subsidized by the operating budget. Mr. Beder indicated the program receives no general fund subsidy.

ENTERPRISE FUND BUDGETS -

Sewer Enterprise –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Sewer Enterprise Fund budget of \$4,802,856 for FY2015, which includes the operating budget, indirect costs, and long-term debt and interest.

Michael Hanlon made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$4,450,164. Linda Benezra, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Water Enterprise –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Water Enterprise Fund budget of \$4,426,688 for FY2015, which includes the operating budget, indirect costs, and long-term and short-term debt and interest.

Michael Hanlon made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$3,244,371. Michael Duffley, second. The motion carries unanimously.

Solid Waste Enterprise –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the Solid Waste Enterprise Fund budget of \$2,506,845 for FY2015, which includes the operating budget, indirect costs, and long-term and short-term debt and interest.

Michael Hanlon made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$2,203,354. Michael Duffley, second. The motion carries unanimously.

SNOW & ICE BUDGET –

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends approval of the DPW Snow & Ice Budget of \$485,000 for FY2015.

Michael Hanlon made a motion to recommend the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$485,000. Michael Hourahan, second.

Cornelius Bakker made a motion to amend the Snow & Ice budget by increasing the budget amount to \$800,000. There was no second to the motion. The motion fails.

Returning to the main motion (recommending the budget amount of \$485,000), the motion carries (11-1-0) Cornelius Bakker voting in opposition.

Ms. Benezra moved to recess. Charles Stevens, second. The motion carries unanimously.

The Committee recessed at 9:45 p.m.

The Committee reconvened at 9:52 p.m.

Report of Budget Sub-Committee F - Public Schools

Cornelius Bakker, Chair, Christopher Merrill, Robert Morgan, Marc Sirrico

See attached Report of Budget Sub-Committee F for the following Departments/Divisions:

#300 Plymouth Public Schools

#390 Medicaid Reimbursement

#391 Out of District Transportation

Cornelius Bakker presented the Sub-Committee F reports and recommendations:

School Department –

Comments:

- The Committee notes with appreciation the deep reduction in energy costs achieved by installation of energy management systems, conversion of heating plants from oil to gas and contracting with a solar grid contractor to generate power for Plymouth's benefit through the power grid.
- We salute Dr. Maestas for his continued emphasis on the delivery of an ever higher quality of education experiences for our students. We recognize that high quality education benefits students today and attracts families to come to Plymouth.
- The Town Manager requested the School District's budget for FY2015 to be decreased by \$1,080,000 to assist the Selectmen to announce a lower tax rate. While the School Committee supported the Superintendent's counter proposal to reduce their budget in the amount of \$777,500, the sub-committee has concluded that the IT reduction of \$250,000 is a strategy Plymouth cannot afford. IT is a major annual expense. Hardware quickly becomes obsolete. Software is constantly being recreated and expanded. Robots, traditionally a feature of science fiction, are a reality. Local employers complain they are

unable to fill many of their job openings because applicants lack the knowledge they require. Use of information technology is a major tool in the rapidly expanding fields of communication, data processing, and information and process management. Our committee concluded that deferring funds for Information Technology is not justified. We also observe that a recovering economy will result in higher costs in subsequent years for the same items.

Recommendations: The sub-committee recommends a \$250,000 increase for technology to the Town Manager's recommended budget. It therefore recommends a modified total budget of \$81,150,750.

Cornelius Bakker made a motion to recommend the modified budget amount of \$81,150,750. Robert Morgan, second.

Linda Benezra said she would not support the increase and indicated the amount of the increase would not necessarily be expended on the technology needs.

Linda Benezra made a motion to amend the budget amount to the Town Manager's recommended budget amount of \$80,900,750. Michael Hanlon second. The motion carries (6-3-3). Charles Stevens, Harry Salerno and Shelagh Joyce abstained.

Returning to the main motion now amended to a budget amount of \$80,900,750, the motion carries (9-0-3). Charles Stevens, Harry Salerno and Shelagh Joyce abstained.

John Moody said the final motion would be to approve the entire Operating Budget (accumulating the totals from Sub-Committees A, B, C, D, F) for a total of \$185,640,779.

Linda Benezra made a motion to recommend the Operating Budget amount of \$185,640, 779. Michael Hourahan, second.

Michael Hanlon said he has reviewed the overtime budgets for Police, Fire and DPW and there appears to be misuse of the overtime line item and suggested reductions in the budgets.

Michael Hanlon made a motion to reduce the Police Overtime budget \$106,660, Fire Overtime \$76,130 and DPW Highway Overtime \$17, 210 for a total of \$200,000 in reductions. Marc Sirrico, second.

Linda Benezra moved to extend the meeting beyond 10:30 p.m. to continue business as presented on the agenda. Richard Gladdys, second. The motion carries (11-0-1). Cornelius Bakker abstained.

Ms. Arrighi said she is disheartened by what has occurred as a result of the motion to reduce overtime. Richard Gladdys was in agreement with Ms. Arrighi and failed to understand why the proposed reduction was not presented in the budget sub-committee reports.

Ms. Joyce asked about the amount of money remaining in budget and if it is used for vacancies. Ms. Barrett said they do budget for vacancies and there may be some vacancy remaining in the Police and Fire budgets due to civil service requirements.

Mr. Hanlon said his intention is to make a second motion to add the \$200,000 back into the Town Manager's budget to allow for the Thousand Acre project to move forward. Ms. Arrighi said she would not be able to do the project justice within the next 18 months even if the funding is available.

The motion to reduce overtime fails (2-10-0). Shelagh Joyce and Michael Hanlon voting in favor.

Charles Stevens moved the main motion to approve the FY2015 Operating Budget in the amount of \$185,640,779. Michael Hourahan, second. The motion carries unanimously.

ATM Article 9 - Capital Outlay Expenditures

Director of Finance, Lynne Barrett provided a brief overview of Article 9 for the Committee, as follows:

Recommending the following:

Paying outright for:

1. The CIC top five ranked projects and the School and Town Building Repair Programs and the Vehicle and Equipment Replacement Program
2. Replacing the climate control unit in the Bartlett History Room of the Library
3. Rehab and Corrosion Repairs to Fire Engine 4, Brush Breaker 179, and removing and replacing underground tanks at Fire Station 5
4. Public Works Public Roads Pavement Preservation program
5. Replace Wooden Foot Bridge at Brewster Garden.

Using local funds and grants to pay for repairs to the Town Wharf, and Police Technology upgrades.

Borrowing to take place for:

1. The CIC #6 ranked project - The repairs and mitigation project planned for the Police Station parking lot due to methane migration from the closed landfill dump.
2. The CIC #8 ranked project – The 1820 Courthouse and Town Hall project (Article 10).
3. The CIC #11 ranked project – the design of the waterfront promenade
4. The CIC #20 – ranked project - Plymco Dam Removal Project – 0% financing through the State Grant Program.
5. The CIC #24 – ranked project – Installation of Signals at South & Sandwich Streets.

The Enterprise funds (sewer, water, and solid waste) also had retained earnings. These costs are borne and paid by the users of these enterprises. The projects being recommended for funding are:

1. Sewer – Winter Street pump station replacement, Warren Avenue sewer extension design and overall sewer system upgrades.
2. Water – The Water Departments top priorities were funded, including, studying and testing the performance of two new permitted wells, restoring the Samoset tank, doing SCADA system upgrades, replacing one truck, and overall infrastructure improvements.
3. Solid Waste – Purchasing a new Front End Loader to replace the 2003 Front End Loader

4. Airport – Use Grant funding and airport retained earnings for the Aviation fuel farm.

**Charles Stevens made a motion to recommend Article 9 Capital Improvement for \$10, 045,281
Michael Duffley, second. The motion carries unanimously.**

**Chairman Moody asked for any further public comment regarding the FY2015 Operating and Capital budgets, seeing none, Charles Stevens moved to close the Public Hearing at 10:50 p.m.
Michael Duffley, second. The motion carries unanimously.**

ADJOURNMENT

Charles Stevens moved for adjournment.

Cornelius Bakker, second. The motion for adjournment carries unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 10:51 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Pamela L. Borgatti